

Navigating Modernity and Coloniality: Text World Theory Analysis of “Our Lady of Paris”

Mubashar Altaf

Air University, Islamabad, Pakistan

Huma Batool

Air University, Islamabad, Pakistan

Keywords

- Text World Theory
- Decolonial Studies
- Modernity
- Coloniality
- Cultural Identity
- Postcolonial Literature
- Narrative Analysis
- Socio-political Dynamics

Abstract

Literature from postcolonial societies often engages with the themes of modernity, coloniality, and cultural identity. Cognitive poetics, which emerged as a new critical lens, offers new insights into these themes. This research paper employs a cognitive framework, Text World Theory (TWT), to comprehensively analyze Daniyal Moeenuddin's short story “Our Lady of Paris”, focusing on its intricate narrative construction and thematic implications. While previous research works examine the text from postcolonial dimensions, current research focuses on the intersection of modernity and coloniality; the study delves deeper into the text's portrayal of the ambivalent attitudes of the colonial subjects. Through TWT, the study analyses the text's textual worlds and narrative advancements, unravelling the layers of meaning embedded within the story. Paul Werth (1990) and Joana Gavins (2007) developed this cognitive framework, which provides a framework for analysing the construction of fictional worlds, enabling a deeper understanding of how characters' mental representations and cognitive conceptualisation shape their actions and decisions. TWT allows the study to explore how characters navigate different text worlds. The narrative centres on the characters of Helen and Sohail, representing contrasting perspectives on modernity – one rooted in Western ideals and the other shaped by postcolonial struggles, and highlighting the complexity of identity in the postcolonial world. The findings showcase the internal conflict of postcolonial subjects who admire Western modernity yet remain unable to attain it. Through this cognitive lens, this study critically engages with themes of power, agency, and identity. The paper contributes to the discourse on decolonizing literary studies and offers insights into how narratives negotiate the legacies of colonialism in contemporary contexts.

1. Introduction

Interdisciplinary research has become an increasingly prominent area of scholarly inquiry. The researchers studying Pakistani Anglophone literature are examining how narrative addresses the legacies of colonialism and the complexities of the cultural and social reality of the contemporary world. Though cognitive poetics is a new emerging lens in literary studies, and researchers have applied it, but its use in postcolonial studies remains a relatively underexplored area. Existing research has focused on the issue of linguistic relativity, colonialism and identity in Pakistani Anglophone literature, such as research by Altaf et al. (2024) and Ali et al. (2024). Still, these often overlooked the cognitive mechanism in shaping characters' decisions identified and practical actions. The study addressed the gap and applied a cognitive lens to the study of "Our Lady of Paris" (2009) by Daniyal Moenuddin to explore how TWT can uncover the multiple text worlds within the story. This study deepens our understanding of the interplay between post-colonial consciousness and Western modernity by focusing on characters' mental constructions to navigate the themes of modernity and coloniality in the post-colonial context. This investigates the cognitive dimension and contributes to the ongoing debate on the enduring impact of colonialism on contemporary postcolonial societies.

Recently, the intersection of cognitive linguistics, decolonial studies and literature has increasingly attracted scholarly attention, and researchers have been exploring how narratives negotiate the complexities of colonial legacies and contemporary socio-cultural worlds. The study gets insights from the Cognitive poetics domain, and the prominent aspect of this study is to examine how texts engage with themes of modernity and coloniality. The researchers employ the cognitive poetic framework, Text World Theory (TWT), to explore the different worlds created within the text to present contrastive themes of modernity and coloniality. The notion of coloniality was first conceptualized by a Peruvian thinker, Anibal Quijano which is further developed by Walter Mignolo in his famous book, *Local Histories/Global Designs*. Mignolo (2011) argues that "The hidden agenda (and darker side) of modernity was coloniality" (p.47).

The researchers take *Our Lady of Paris* for the current study. This short story is the seventh story of the book; Daniyal Moenuddin's *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders*. It was first published in 2009, and it explores the complexities of life in contemporary Pakistani postcolonial society. It focuses mainly on the themes of class, identity and postcolonial psychological conflicts. "Our Lady of Paris" provides a rich tapestry for investigating the complexity of modernity and coloniality within a postcolonial context. The narrative is set against the backdrop of contemporary Pakistan. The worlds are woven around the characters grappling with colonialism's legacy while navigating the complexity of modernity.

The application of Text World Theory as a data analysis method yields the textual construction of multiple worlds within the narrative and discovers the discourse between Western modernity and indigenous cultural perspectives. The study interrogates how the characters negotiate their identities and relationships within these textual worlds. "TWT proposes that the meaning of a text is generated by the reader constructing a mental representation or text world. The reader processes textual cues by generating representative worlds constructed from the reader's background knowledge and personal embodied experience" (Werth, 1999, p. 28). The current research aims to deepen our

knowledge about the literature and its role in shaping and reflecting socio-cultural realities. The study situates the text within the broader context of postcolonial literature. It contributes to ongoing discussions surrounding cultural identity, modernity, and coloniality, an enduring impact of colonialism on contemporary societies.

Despite the research works on Pakistani Anglophone writings, there remains a notable research gap in the application of cognitive poetics within postcolonial studies, particularly the TWT. On the other hand, Text World Theory has been employed by many researchers, but no one yet employed it to uncover the cognitive mechanism shaping characters' decisions and actions. The current study is unique in the sense it entangles, different threads such as cognitive poetic, literature, and postcolonial studies.

1.1. Research Objectives

2. To explore how the characters' experiences and interactions reflect their ambivalent attitudes toward Western modernity.
3. To identify and examine the textual strategies employed in depicting the story's conflicting narratives of modernity and coloniality.

1.2. Research Questions

2. In what ways does the narrative of “Our Lady of Paris” engage with the interplay between Western modernity and postcolonial consciousness?
3. How does Text-World Theory facilitate the analysis of “Our Lady of Paris” in navigating the tensions between modernity and coloniality?
4. What textual elements contribute to constructing multiple text worlds in the narrative, and how do they reflect the complexities of cultural identity?

1.3. Significance of the Study

The study is interdisciplinary as it integrates cognitive poetics, decolonial approach, and the postcolonial literature to analyze “Our Lady of Paris”. This research sheds light on the intricate interplay between coloniality and modernity. It deepens our knowledge and understanding of how short fiction navigates complex socio-cultural themes, particularly in postcolonial contexts. By exploring the discourse between Western modernity and postcolonial consciousness, the study offers insights into broader problems of power, cultural identity, and the legacy of colonialism. The study enriches us with the specific text and provides valuable perspectives on the broader implications of literature in portraying challenges and prevailing sociocultural paradigms.

2. Literature Review

The present study is grounded in the intersection of literature, decoloniality studies, and cognitive poetics. It offers insights into the complex web of cultural identity, power relations, and historical legacies. Within cognitive poetics, Text-World Theory (TWT) has emerged as a valuable analytical tool for exploring the narrative construction of textual worlds and conveying meaning to readers.

2.1. Postcolonial Literature and Identity

This field encompasses a variety of literary works that examine colonial legacies and their enduring impact on cultural identity and representation. Scholars such as Edward Said, Gayatri Spivak and Homi K. Bhabha have pioneered postcolonial critical studies to understand how colonial discourse shapes the perceptions of the self and others (Said, 1978; Bhabha, 1994). Bhabha (1994) elaborates on and highlights the complex ideas of hybridity and cultural hybridity. Gayatri calls herself a deconstructive Marxist Feminist thinker, and Edward Said centres on the misrepresentation of the East. But recently, postcolonial studies has taken decolonial turn.

2.2. Decolonial Studies

Decolonial Studies is a new discipline, rapidly emerging, and it is based on theorists like Aime Cesaire, Walter Dignolo, Frantz Fanon, and Anibal Quijano who promote methodologies that challenge dominant narratives and amplify marginalised voices, fostering alternative perspectives on history, identity, and resistance. Dignolo argues that decoloniality seeks to dismantle Western-centric perspectives and hierarchies of knowledge, advocating for the recognition and empowerment of diverse epistemologies (Dignolo, 2011). Frantz Fanon's works emphasize the transformative potential of literature in decolonizing minds and societies, asserting that colonialism distorts colonizers' and colonized people's psyches and social structures (Fanon, 1963). Together, their theories contribute to a critical framework that interrogates colonial legacies and promotes narratives of liberation and empowerment.

2.3. Modernity and Coloniality

The dialectic of modernity and coloniality forms the central theme in decolonial studies. Scholars such as Walter D. Dignolo and Anibal Quijano examined how coloniality persists in the contemporary socio-cultural context. According to Dignolo (2011), "the hidden agenda (and darker side) of modernity was coloniality" (p. 47). Their concept of colonial modernity emphasises how Western notions of progress, development, and identity are intertwined with colonial power structures that perpetuate hierarchies of knowledge and marginalize Indigenous epistemologies. The current study employs these notions of postcolonial and decolonial studies along with cognitive poetics, in which the text world theory is a good model for analyzing the cognitive side of the text and the reader.

2.4. Text World Theory

Paul Werth developed this theory, which provides a framework for analyzing the construction of fictional worlds within literary texts. According to Werth (1999), 'TWT proposes that the meaning of a text is generated by the reader constructing a mental representation or text world. "The reader processes textual cues by generating representative worlds constructed from the reader's background knowledge and personal embodied experience" (p. 28). TWT allows the study to explore how characters navigate different worlds of the text. The meanings are interpreted through the intersections of various imaginary worlds. Textual worlds are connected to the large, diverse world where socio-cultural ideas are used.

2.5. Critical Scholarship

Exploring Daniyal Mueenuddin's short stories through various critical lenses has provided valuable insights into Pakistan's socio-political and cultural landscape. There have been extensive scholarly studies into the issues of linguistics, identity and postcolonial identity in Pakistani Anglophone literature. However, these research works often overlook the cognitive processes underlying the construction of worlds of stories. For example, Altaf et al. (2024) explored colonial legacies and identity. However, their study does not fully incorporate the cognitive angle to examine how these theories are represented through the mental constructions of the text world. Similarly, Ali et al. (2024) focused primarily on linguistic relativity, and Gohar et al. (2023) investigated the interplay between poetry and art. Malik et al. (2022) evaluated the language pragmatically in Parveen Shakir's translated poetry. On the other hand, Batool et al. (2022) explained how language appropriation strategies empower postcolonial voices. The researchers Batool et al. study the conceptualization of sadness in the Urdu language through metaphors and their mapping. They used Khadija Mastoor's *Aangan* to show how sadness is metaphorically represented through sensory experiences and it supports both cultural and physiological embodiment of human emotions. Haq et al. examine Khalid Hosseini's fiction, *A Thousand Splendid Suns* (2007), to explore its narrative structure. They employed Vladimir Propp's narrative theory to reveal the archetypal fairy tale structure of the novel. In another study, Altaf and Batool (2024) examined cognitive strategies of decoloniality in *The Golden Legend* (2017); they focused on how the text incorporated Pluriversity, epistemic disobedience and border thinking as strategies to challenge the colonial matrix of power. The study employed a lens of decoloniality to highlight the potential of fostering alternative narratives to amplify the marginalized voices on the global stage. These papers employed frameworks from cognitive poetics but with different approaches; the current study employed TWT to explore postcolonial identity and modernity.

Another researcher, Waheed (2017), employed Marxist criticism to analyse the socioeconomic factors depicted in *Other Rooms, Other Wonders* (2009). This analysis revealed the profound impact of economic pressures on shaping characters and societal norms. It underscored the urgent need for societal changes to address these forces' ramifications on individuals' lives. Similarly, Tariq (2018) focused on portraying the feudal system in Punjab, Pakistan, within Mueenuddin's narratives, drawing parallels with Marx and Engels' discussions on class struggles. Tariq advocated for increased awareness and literature addressing this issue by highlighting the persistent presence of feudalism in rural Pakistan. Building on these socioeconomic analyses. On the other hand, Nazir et al. (2022) examined the cultural representation of rural Pakistan in Mueenuddin's work through a postcolonial lens. Their study explored the global commodification of cultural differences and authenticity challenges in the postcolonial world, shedding light on the complexities of identity formation in contemporary society.

Shazia Sadaf (2014) delved into the portrayal of Pakistani masculinity in *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders* (2009), elucidating the shift from colonial power dynamics to post-colonial corruption and its impact on male identity. Through themes of death and rebirth, Sadaf metaphorically unpacked the evolving notions of masculinity within Pakistani society. Further enriching the discourse but Hai (2014) examined the representation of domestic servants as central figures in Mueenuddin's narratives, emphasizing their vulnerability, agency, and interiority within the context of Pakistan's postcolonial feudal system. By evoking empathy and encouraging ethical action, Mueenuddin's stories aimed to amplify the voices of marginalized individuals striving for agency amidst structures of power.

Finally, Javaid et al. (2021) explored the concept of hybridity and identity crisis in Mueenuddin's stories "Our Lady of Paris" and 'Lily.' Their study illuminated the complexities of colonial identity and the experience of multiple cultural identities in the postcolonial context, further expanding the critical discourse surrounding Mueenuddin's literary oeuvre.

2.6. Research Gap

Despite the extensive research on *In Other Room, Other Wonders* (2009, which ranges from linguistics analyses to Marxist studies, No scholar explored the cognitive mechanism that shapes the characters' decisions, actions, and cultural identity in the postcolonial context. The current research primarily focuses on the text's cognitive dimensions to fill this gap.

3. Research Methodology

The present study emphasizes a qualitative approach informed by Text World Theory to examine 'Our Lad of Paris' through the lens of modernity and coloniality. The Qualitative methodology provides an in-depth study of textual elements and narrative structure. It helps us understand the complex themes and dynamics within the text. We have taken "Our Lady of Paris" for the study due to its narrative with rich thematic complexity and its engagement with postcolonial issues, particularly its tension between modernity and coloniality. The story within the broad Pakistani Anglophone literature provides an ideal case study to explore cognitive worlds and their struggle with identity, which aligns perfectly with research objectives. Moeenduddin's *In Other Room, Other Wonders* collection may deal with history and colonialism. Still, "Our Lady of Paris" stands out due to its profound psychological portrayal of complex mental landscapes and identity shifts. This makes this story an ideal text to explore the cognitive and psychological dynamics of characters struggling to cope with modernity and coloniality.

3.1. Data Collection

The study's primary text is "Our Lady of Paris", a short story from the collection *In Other Rooms, Other Wonders* (2009). The narrative will be examined closely to identify narrative strategies, structure, textual cues, and thematic motifs relevant to the study objectives.

3.2. Textual Analysis

The text will be studied using the Text-Word Theory (TWT), which provides a framework for classifying and identifying textual worlds and helps us explore constructed fictional worlds. The researcher will apply TWT to identify narrative-advancing propositions, textual clues, and inferences to map the textual worlds created with the story. The data is analyzed by mapping the various mental representations that emerge in response to the narrative. The data analysis is structured in the following parts: discourse word, text word, word switches, and modal worlds.

3.3. The Text World (Matrix World)

The text constructs this initial primary world by the world-building elements within the text (characters, locations, time, and objects) and function-advancing propositions as building blocks to form the story's setting and atmosphere. It is also called the matrix world that moves the narrative forward.

3.4. World Switches

This occurs when the narrative shifts focus from one character, time or place to another. The text creates sub worlds, with their own set of rules, events and characters. This allows the story to explore the conflicts between different characters, beliefs, values and cultural contexts. According to Werth (1999), world switches create new worlds that portray a struggle between different world views.

3.5. Modal Worlds

Modal worlds represent the hypothetical epistemic, or desire driven realms where characters express their beliefs, desires, and internal struggles. It expresses cognition of the characters, their motivation, and their emotional reactions. There are epistemic modality, the characters, knowledge and beliefs and boulaemic modality, their wishes, and desire.

3.6. Discourse World

It connects the narrative to the wider outside social, cultural and historical context. In the case of *Our Lady of Paris*, this world addresses the themes of coloniality, modernity and the tension between Western and postcolonial conceptions of modernity.

In the Data Analysis part, the study focuses on identifying world-building elements within each text world. Such as location, enactors, time and objects. These elements help the researchers as cues and markers that build each world; and also propel the narrative forward through function-advancing propositions. Through the identification of different worlds, such as the matrix world, world switches, modal worlds and discourse world, the study traces the way these elements interact to produce meanings. The text is a space where conflicts of modernity and coloniality are not merely displayed but lived and it is evident when characters navigate the enduring legacy of colonization in their pursuit of freedom, belonging and identity.

3.7. Decolonial Lens

TWT provides the framework, but the interpretation will be done from a decolonial lens, particularly the works of Walter Dignolo and Nasir Abbas Nayyar. By applying the decolonial lens, the study aims to connect the text to the larger discourse world and to discover the hidden colonial debates of modernity and colonial modernity, which is coloniality.

The study acknowledges that to capture the full complexity of the socio-political and cultural dimensions of the text, the TWT may be limited in capacity because it primarily focuses on mental representations and textual structures. To mitigate this issue, the paper included decolonial approach and Text world theory to provide a more comprehensive balanced analysis. It is a qualitative study largely based on interpretation; the researchers

also accept their own biases regarding modernity and coloniality as they are members of postcolonial society and will try their best not to overshadow the pattern of characters, identities, and internal conflict.

3.8. Theoretical Framework

The study integrates Text-World Theory (TWT) with concepts from decolonial studies, particularly Walter Mignolo and Nasir Abbas Nayar's perspectives, to examine the short story "Our Lady of Paris" within the context of modernity and coloniality.

3.9. Decolonial Studies

Walter Mignolo and Anibal Quijano (2024) invented the ideas of coloniality, decoloniality, and the darker side of Western modernity and laid the foundation of decolonial studies. This field incorporates the critical lens to study how narrative reflects perpetual colonial power dynamics and epistemic hierarchies. They introduced their groundbreaking decolonial ideas in significant works such as *On Decoloniality* (2018), *The Darker Side of Western Modernity* (2011), *The Darker Side of the Renaissance* (1995), *Local Histories/Global Designs* (2000), *The Politics of Decolonial Investigations* (2021), and *Aníbal Quijano: Foundational Essays on the Coloniality of Power* (2024). Decolonial writers criticize and challenge Western-centric perspectives and highlight colonialism's ongoing legacies in shaping contemporary socio-cultural discourse. The researcher also takes insights from a renowned Pakistani decolonial critic, Nasir Abbas Nayar, to study the debate of modernity and coloniality.

3.10. Modernity and Coloniality

The study is centred around the two central concepts of decolonial debate, modernity and coloniality, as proposed by Anibal Quijano, Maria Lugones, Walter Mignolo, and Nasir Abbas Nayar. Traditionally understood as progress and development, modernity is examined through a decolonial lens to reveal its entanglement with the colonial power structure and epistemology hierarchies. "The hidden agenda (and darker side) of modernity was coloniality" (Mignolo, 2011, p. 47). Coloniality refers to the enduring effects of colonialism on the socio-cultural, political, and economic system, shaping country identities and the knowledge system.

3.11. Text World Theory (TWT)

It was proposed by Paul Werth (1999) and further developed by Joanna Gavings (2007). It is a comprehensive framework for analyzing narrative texts by conceptualizing them as constructed mental representations or Text Worlds. According to Gavin (2007), the narrative creates immersive worlds with distinct characters, settings, events, and propositions, inflicting readers' cognitive processes and interpretations. The framework for analysis is based on the cognitive poetic lens. Text world theory (TWT), proposed by Paul Werth (1999), explains how readers' minds create mental representations of events while processing literature. The researchers employ TWT in this paper to explore the modernity and coloniality in the text of "Our Lady of Paris". TWT says that text worlds exist, mental constructs formed by readers to perceive and conceptualize literary narratives. "TWT proposes that the meaning of a text is generated by the reader constructing a mental representation or text world. The reader processes textual cues by generating representative

worlds constructed from the reader's background knowledge and personal embodied experience" (Werth, 1999, p. 28). TWT has three interconnecting levels: The engagement level, the mental representation level, and the sub-world level.

The first level deals with the engagement of two or more participants in the language event. It can be face-to-face or distanced communication or in the form of text, where distance is temporal. The participants communicate with personal backgrounds such as world knowledge, intentions, memories, motivation, and culture. These influence text engagement and affect the negotiation process with the text and its meaning.

The second level of text world theory analysis is the mental representation level. At this level, the reader constructs a mental representation or text world to process the literature. The cues in the text serve to stimulate the reader's emotions and memories. Through his schemas, the reader infers the meanings of the narrative. The reader experiences the text in their mind by creating representative worlds. Personal embodied experience and background knowledge of the world and culture are vital in generating the mental world. Different meanings by the other readers may be perceived from the exact text. The precise textual cues may create and develop multiple meanings for various readers. A single reader may conceive different worlds from the precise text while reading at other times.

The sub-world level is the third and final level of text-world theory (TWT) analysis. It is also known as New Worlds. The main world is also called the matrix world; many other worlds that depart from this are created once constructed. These newly built worlds can be classified into two subtypes: world-switches and modal worlds. Moralisation in the discourse resulted in the modal worlds. We can divide modal worlds into three types: Deontic modality, Boulomaic modality, and epistemic modality.

The narrative showcases epistemic modality by displaying the characters' knowing, beliefs, and thinking. It also deals with the dimensions of possibility and probability. "The third level of TWT analysis is the sub-world level, which includes world-switches and modal worlds. World switches occur when the central focus of the narrative is switched, and a new world is created. Modal worlds are created due to moralization in discourse and are further divided into deontic, boulomaic, and epistemic modalities" (Gavins, 2007, p. 64). Paul Werth's book, "Text Worlds: Representing Conceptual Space in Discourse", shows the applicability of the TWT to both fictional and factual works. This framework provides a cognitive model to understand the mental process of the readers while reading the literature. It talks about how the readers process the literature cognitively. It studies and analyses the selected work in totality. It considers text as well as the content of the text. TWT is a cognitive poetic framework applicable to a wide range of texts. By using this, we can understand and process literary works better. It studies readers' representation of the text in their minds. Paul Werth enlightens us on this subject and says, "TWT is a cognitive model for processing literature that focuses on how readers create dynamic representations of events in their minds. It is useful and applicable to factual and fictional works and enables the examination of their entirety by taking text and context" (Werth, 1999, p. 1).

• Key Points of the Framework

The study employs Text World Theory (TWT) as a framework to investigate Our Lady of Paris's fictional discourse through three interconnected levels

- i. **Discourse World:** it is the larger outer level which connects the text to the broad discourse of history, society and culture. It is the context of the communication event.
- ii. **Text World:** in the text, each character constructs the mental representations to understand the discourse, which is shaped by language choices, and background knowledge of the character.
- iii. **Sub-Worlds:** these are additional worlds, which are created through shifts in place, time, and perspectives, for example, Word-switches (e.g. flashbacks) and modal worlds (e.g. potential or hypothetical scenarios) Modernity/Coloniality, Text World Theory & “Our Lady of Paris”

In the short fiction, “Our Lady of Paris” (2009), Text World Theory (TWT) is an analytical tool to dig into the narrative’s exploration of coloniality and modernity within the context of postcolonial Pakistan. TWT provides a framework to examine how readers construct mental representations/text worlds from textual cues. It integrates their background knowledge and personal experiences (Werth, 1999). The researchers find this framework apt to scrutinize the interplay between Western ideals of modernity and the enduring effects of colonialism on cultural identity and socio-political dynamics. The narrative of “Our Lady of Paris” unfolds through the contrasting perspectives of Helen and Sohail. They symbolize the clash between the Eurocentric concept and the Indigenous response to colonial legacies. Through text world theory, the study examines Moeenuddin’s narrative construction of multiple textual worlds. It highlights how characters navigate these spaces and negotiate their identities amidst the complexities of postcolonial conditions. The study aligns with the decolonial perspectives established by Walter Mignolo and Aníbal Quijano (2014), who critique coloniality, the darker idea of Western modernity. This analysis enriches our understanding of how literature evolves and reflects the ongoing discourse surrounding modernity and colonialism in the contemporary era by employing TWT within the decolonial framework.

4. Data Analysis

The researchers divide this part of the paper into the text and discourse worlds. The text worlds are the mental mapping of the text. The researchers in this analysis also chart the reader's mental journey from different worlds and the structure of the text worlds. The researchers table the narrative into text worlds, such as matrix, world switches, and modal worlds. In the discourse world, the themes of modernity and coloniality, traced in the text world, are discussed and connected to the more considerable debate of decolonial discourse. Each text world is built by world-building elements given in the analysis. Some function-advancing propositions are addressed during the mapping of the narrative.

4.1. The Text World

The layer of TWT, known as the text world or matrix world, consists of the mental representations of the text. In Table 1 when we encounter the line, “Sohail and Helen had begun dating two years earlier at Yale” (Moeenuddin, 2009, p. 130). The text world is built with world-building elements by mentioning places, objects, and characters. The function-advancing propositions are used to propel the narrative. The narrative exposes the relationship between Sohail and Helen. The suspense is created when the issue of their

future is hinted when “They had agreed to put the question of their future in abeyance...” (Mueenuddin, 2009, p.143). They belong to two different cultures and have different versions of modernity. The narrative also switches to the matrix world and the modal worlds of desires and wishes of the characters. These modal worlds express the association of their version of modernity. Paul Werth's book, *Text Worlds: Representing Conceptual Space in Discourse*, describes interactions between the text and the mental process that constructs the text world. “The construction of a text world is not a solitary process but is guided by the language of the text and the interactions between the text and the reader's mental processes” (Werth, 1995, p. 16).

The narrative shifts the location from New York to Karachi, Pakistan, the family mansion of Sohail. The big house signifies Sohail's status as a landowning class in postcolonial Pakistan. Sohail's mother's anxiety over the love affair between Sohail and Helen portrays the limitations of their colonial modernity.

Table 1

World Building Elements

Time: two years earlier

Location: New York, Yale University.

Enactors: Helen, Sohail

Function Advancing Propositions

- “Sohail and Helen had begun” (Moeenuddin, 2009, p.110).
 - He (had returned) to his home” (Moeenuddin, 2009, p.146)
 - They (had agreed)she finished school” (Moeenuddin, 2009, p.146).
-

This setting and the story's events in Karachi introduce the colonial modernity in postcolonial Pakistan. Sohail's parents are concerned about their son's desire to marry Helen, who belongs to American Culture. The subsequent story explains that Harounis, who are postcolonial subjects, admire Western modernity, but at the same time, they are anxious. It reflects the colonized mind that has been only fed the unique text of modernity by the British rulers in the past. As Macaulay states: “We must at present do our best to form a class who may be interpreters between us and the millions whom we govern; a class of persons, Indian in blood and colour, but English in taste, in opinions, in morals, and intellect” (Ashcroft, 2003, p. 430). Harouni's family accumulated countless wealth after

independence but never experienced the true sense of modernity. Because of their colonial past and colonial matrix of power, they are unable to find their true independent self and are struggling with coloniality's weight.

The narrative then introduces Sohail's Mother, Rafia, and a once beautiful and influential woman from a prominent, cultured family in Lucknow, who is a patriarchal woman. She is also suffering from the anxiety of colonial modernity. However, the colonial subconscious constraints have curbed her personality, but she suffers from the tyranny of the patriarchal society and the colonial matrix of power. In the discourse world, the text criticizes colonial modernity, saying that no one in this world of suffocation is free and satisfied, and everyone desires freedom but cannot find it due to the invisible enduring effects of colonization of the mind.

Rafia and Amjad Harouni idealize Western modernity, including freedom and choice. Helen's character visibly portrays this. The narrative portrays that the Pakistani elite desires the Western way of life but is inwardly afraid of embracing modernity. When he informed his mother about his decision to visit Paris to meet Helen "she pursed her lips but said nothing" (Mueenuddin, 2009, 143). The narrative exposes the internal paradox of the landowning class of postcolonial Pakistan. "Sohail had vaguely committed himself to joining his father's sprawling business a sugar mill, farmlands, and much else" (Mueenuddin, 2009, p. 143). Sohail represents the new generation that, unlike their ancestors, is moving to embrace modernity in its proper form. There is conflict in the minds of postcolonial subjects; they admire modernity but are always hesitant to be absorbed by it.

The text highlights colonial modernity's negative side. Function-advancing propositions propel the narrative, and one can visualize both cultural worlds and feel the conflict between them. The preceding world is built on word-building elements: every text world is built on similar elements.

Table 2

World Building Elements

Time: Fall

Location: Karachi, Pakistan

Enactors: Sohail, Rafia, Amjad

Objects: mansion, the old house, Banyan tree

Function Advancing Proposition

- "He lived that fall" (Mueenuddin, 2009, p.110)
- "When he announced...., she pursed her lips but said nothing" (Mueenuddin, 2009, p.110).
- "He had been avoiding her" ... "I thought we might come to Paris. She said this brightly" (Mueenuddin, 2009, p.110).

Then again, the narrative shifts from Karachi to Paris. Paris is painted as a world of freedom, love, fantasy, and romance. In Saint Louis, Sohail arranges an apartment and cleans it before Helen arrives. He carries her bag on his head up to the sixth-floor garret, which shows his love and desire for Helen. The text showcases modernity, signified by liberty, fraternity, and equality. The author describes the rain and a scene of a river from the window, depicting Helen's dream world, free from colonial modernity, and she can visualise and feel ecstasy. Sohail watches Helen getting dressed for the first dinner with his parents and inhales the scent of her beautiful hair. They walk past in front of Notre Dame and along the left bank of the Seine; the name Notre-Dame translates to "Our Lady," referring to the Virgin Mary. This connects the cathedral to Mary, a central figure in Christianity, symbolizing purity, maternal love, and intercession; it symbolizes their love which has a power that can dissolve their cultural differences. The text builds a world that shows how love is an emotion that links people, no matter their religion, colour, or culture. Helen is depicted as a free individual ready to choose her future course of life, while Sohail's parents worry about losing their son and are not prepared to give him the freedom to choose. Sohail leans down and kisses Helen when she says, "You know, the Seine does not divide Paris; it keeps the city together. It is just the right width, not a little stream but a public place in the heart of the city" (Mueenuddin p. 133). The river symbolizes love that unites them and can break the binaries and boundaries of cultures.

Table 3

World Building Elements

Time: just before Christmas

Location: Paris, Saint Louis

Enactors: Sohail, Helen, Rafia, Amjad Hourini

Objects: Notre Dame, River Seine

Function Advancing Propositions

- "Sohail had borrowed an apartment" (Moeenuddin, 2009, p.111).
- "Arriving in Paris"" Sohail cleaned the apartment" (Moeenuddin, 2009, p.111).
- "After collecting Helen"....."Sohail carried her bag on his head" (Moeenuddin, 2009, p.111).

When Sohail and Helen meet Harounis, Sohail's parents, Helen demonstrates self-confidence and integrity by extending her hand and introducing herself directly to Sohail's

mother with a flat palm and unwavering eye contact. This exemplifies modernity's emphasis on individuality and self-respect. Meanwhile, Rafia, Sohail's mother, welcomes them with a stiff smile, and the reader can sense that she feels some hidden anxiety in this encounter. As they admire the apartment's high ceilings and delicate furnishings, a woman sings in French on the stereo, and Rafia lights candles. Sohail's father, who had previously left the room, returns and informs them, "It belongs to Brigadier Hazari said his father, sitting down again in front of the fire" (Mueenuddin, 2009, p.147).

The narrative progresses as Amjad and Helen discuss the contrasting cultures of America and Pakistan. The reader discerns that Sohail faces a decision between two worlds, modernity and coloniality. Helen asserts that the American way of life has a structure that would be suitable for Sohail to live in. On the other hand, Amjad Harouni holds Americans in high regard, admiring their freedom and the liberty to live as they please. He expresses, "I admire the Americans tremendously" (Mueenuddin, 2009, p. 136) and wishes he had been born in America as it is the happiest place in the world for him. When Helen asks him why he is American, he responds,

I sometimes feel that the one thing I have missed is the sensation of being free, doing precisely what I like, going where I want, and acting as I like. I suspect that only an American ever feels that. Your families do not weigh you down, and you are not weighed down by history. (Mueenuddin, 2009, p.136)

The central theme of the story is painted with these words: the conflict and anxiety in the minds under the influence of the colonial past. The author portrays this through Amjad Harouni's voice, who expresses his admiration for American culture and modernity and his mental dissatisfaction and anxiety about colonial modernity because it is a caricature of modernity. Despite being one of the feudal who accumulated wealth through corrupt means, Amjad still yearns for freedom and sees salvation in modernity. Internally, they are divided. They admire modernity but fear that Helen may take Sohail away from her modern world. This conversation and this reply from Amjad, father of Sohail, is the crux of this debate: modernity and colonial modernity.

Rafia surprises them with tickets for 'the Sleeping Beauty ballet' at the Garnier Opera on Christmas Eve. Sleeping Beauty is symbolic and significant. The colonised are sleeping due to the curse of colonial modernity, which The West wrote to conquer the colonised minds to loot their lands and plunder the resources. The colonised need a kiss of modernity to awaken again and discover their proper position, culture, and potential.

On New Year's Eve, Sohail and Helen rent a car to spend time in the countryside. When they return to Paris, they find that the Harounis are still in town. After exchanging Christmas gifts, Rafia invites Helen for tea at Hotel George V to spend some time alone. Both women meet to discuss Sohail and his future. Rafia feels jealous of Helen's influence on Sohail. They argue about Sohail's future. Symbolically, it is a debate between modernity and colonial modernity. Rafia argues that Sohail would lose his identity in American society and might adopt a subservient attitude. Helen senses that Rafia and their colonial modernity mindset would not leave Sohail to live his choice of life. The readers experience the modal worlds of desires and hypotheses. Helen's conflict is expressive in her randomly selecting the place to spend the night at an old inn named Beaugency, symbolizing their crumbling relationship. The reader senses the impending tragic end when Helen softly utters, "I cannot believe Paris is over" (Mueenuddin, 2009, p. 154), aware of

Sohail's proximity. Helen embodies Western cultural traits, taking independent decisions and responsibility, while Sohail belongs to the world of coloniality.

Table 4

World Building Elements

Time: Christmas Eve, Christmas

Location: Paris, Opera, Quai des Grands, HÂtel George V, Beaugency, inn in Montresor

Enactors: Sohail, Helen, Amjab, Rafia

Objects: The Necklace, Sleeping Beauty at the Garnier

Function Advancing Propositions

- “Sohail sat watching Helen dressed” (Moeenuddin, 2009, p.146)
- “Helen extended her palm”(Moeenuddin, 2009, p.113).
- “Helen and Sohail walked along the cold Seine” (Moeenuddin, 2009, p.112).
- “While he recited, she looked at him” (Moeenuddin, 2009, p.119).
- “Rafia had gotten tickets” (Moeenuddin, 2009, p.119)
- “Sohail and Helen decided to rent a car and spend New Year’s Eve” (Moeenuddin, 2009, p.122)
- “I do not know, cried Rafia, startling Helen” (Moeenuddin, 2009, p.125).
- “Helen wandered away” (Moeenuddin, 2009, p.129).

4.2. The Sub-Worlds

The researchers analysed the sub-worlds in “Our Lady of Paris” (2009) through the Text-World Theory (TWT) framework. These sub-worlds are categorised into world switches and modal worlds. The first sub-world in the story as a world-switch occurs when the narrative's central focus is switched from one character to another. “World switches occur when the central focus of the narrative is switched, and a new world is created” (Werth, 1999, p. 47). The story starts with describing the protagonists, Sohail, who struggles to carry the weight of her family's expectations, and Helen, a symbol of modernity's Western version. “The first subworld begins when readers are introduced to her character, situation, and struggles” (Gavins, 2007, p. 78).

The narrative propels, and the world switches to a sub-world distinct from the earlier one. The characters from two different cultures struggle to accommodate in this context.

Professor Werth describes this phenomenon in these worlds: “The worldswitch creates a new sub-world distinct from the previous one, and it highlights the parallel struggles of two characters from different cultural backgrounds” (Werth, 1995, p. 62).

Another subworld in the narrative is the modal world. It is weaved through epistemic modality and revolves around the characters' beliefs, knowledge, and thinking. These text worlds narrate Rafia’s cultural beliefs and class consciousness grounded in colonial modernity. Colonial modernity’s values are expressed through opinions, beliefs, and wishes.

Boulmaic modality creates another sub-world, a world of wishes and desires. The narrative weaves the conflict between the desires of different characters. Helen represents the Western values of freedom and individuality. At the same time, Sohail struggles against his family constraints and dreams of becoming a painter despite the disapproval of his mother, who represents the colonial values of modernity.

These sub-worlds in the narrative structure give insights into the complex nature of modernity vs colonial modernity and debate how an individual is the product of history and culture. Although this story doesn’t provide a clear end to the story, another story in the collection, Lily and ‘A Spoiled Man’ gives us information that the relationship between Helen and Sohail did not survive. Finally, Sohail had to marry Sonya, a woman from his social class and culture.

“Oh, East is East, and West is West, and never the twain shall meet” (Rudyard Kipling).

However, East is not East, and West is not West. Still, both are epistemological constructs of colonial modernity, and the purpose was to separate them so that the so-called West could maintain its supremacy and hegemony.

Table 5

Narrative map of Text Worlds

Switched worlds	The matrix worlds	Modal worlds
Helen and Sohail's meeting at Yale University	Sohail is in Karachi with his parents.	Helen and Sohail's assumptions about their future (Epistemic world)
	Helen and Sohail meeting in Paris	Helen's Desires and fantasies about Paris and her future life with Sohail (Boulamaic World)
	Sohail’s parents, Amjad Hourini and Helen’s Meeting in Paris	Sohail's parents discuss Helen's freedom and American life (Epistemic world)

Helen and Rafia's meeting in a hotel in Paris	Helen and Raifa discussion about the future of Sohail (Epistemic world)
Helen and Sohail meeting in Paris	Amjad Hauronis's discussion with Helen about his desire to be born (Boulamaic world)

4.3. Discourse World

It is a world where text enters into the world of discourse. The central theme of the short fiction revolves around modernity and the values of autonomy and individuality of the person in society. Mueenuddin portrays a rural servant class of landowners with a colonial mentality, and K.K Harouni is the link in all eight stories. In his interview, Mueenuddin expressed his objective in writing these short stories: to communicate to Western readers about Pakistan and its society. His short stories are widely read and translated into 16 languages (Mueenuddin, 2009). “Our Lady of Paris” (2009) represents modernity and coloniality in symbolic form. Modernity is known in the West as liberty, equality, and freedom from constraints; on the other hand, colonial modernity is a different text written by the West to enslave non-Europeans to plunder their lands and loot their resources. They introduced the caricature of modernity in the colonised world with false promises of development and salvation. The text of “Our Lady of Paris” (2009) expresses the two different modernity versions, cued by linguistic expressions: the free world of modernity and colonial modernity, which is, in reality, coloniality, the world of constraints. The narrative's primary setting is Paris, considered one of the centres of fashion, literature, freedom, and love. Mustansar Hussain Tarar, a renowned Pakistani Urdu writer, states that Paris is the Mecca of literature. On the other hand, Pakistani rural society in the 70s to 90s was predominantly feudal and had a colonial legacy, which is corrupt. There was a wide gap between the rich and poor in Pakistan (Butt, 2009). Joanna Gavins' *Text World Theory: An Introduction* (2007) supports the idea that readers construct dynamic mental representations or text worlds as they read, continually updated and modified based on new textual cues. This is relevant to the data analysis of the article, as it suggests that the readers' construction of text worlds in response to the story may have been influenced by their background knowledge and experiences. “The readers' schemata are activated as they read, and they continually update and modify their text worlds as they receive new textual cues” (Gavins, 2007, p. 35).

The story “Our Lady of Paris” (2009) revolves around the negative influences of coloniality. Rafia, Sohail's mother, obstructs the growing romantic relationship between him and Helen, who has a different experience of modernity represented by freedom and self-reliance. The story highlights the ambivalent attitudes towards freedom and choice and how enduring legacies of colonialism persist in postcolonial Pakistan. The characters' attraction towards modernity and reluctance to adopt make them colonial subjects. “The

next night was Christmas Eve, and Rafia had gotten tickets for the ballet. Sleeping Beauty at the Gamier” (Mueenuddin, 209, p. 155). The postcolonial world is a sleeping beauty cursed by colonial modernity's magic. Colonisers are cut off from their past, history, and environment. They need a kiss of modernity to be reawakened to reclaim their authentic self.

4.4 Key Findings

Aspect	Details
Colonial Modernity	Characters’ cognition is portrayed through tensions between western modernity and colonial legacy in postcolonial Pakistan.
Cultural Paradox	Characters though admire Western modernity but they are unable to embrace it due to their colonial cognitive formation.
Symbolism of Paris	Paris has symbolic value which represents values of modernity. Paris is portrayed as Utopian dream of modernity and Karachi as a space of coloniality.
Narrative Structure	The internal conflict is showcases through construction of different mental worlds, when characters grapple with the complexity of coloniality and modernity.
Discourse	Characters from postcolonial background, struggle to break free from coloniality. The narrative discusses on discourse level, the themes of modernity and colonial modernity, which shows coloniality is not a thing of the past but a present reality. Colonials legacies continue to shape identities, which creates cognitive conflict and ambivalence
Decolonization of the Mind	The narrative suggests the need to decolonize the minds because the postcolonial subjects are suffering due to the conditioning of coloniality.

The text is mapped through the TWT framework, to analyze the conflict of modernity and coloniality. The characters are at a crossroads where they admire Western modernity and yet they are burdened by the baggage of colonialism. Every character from a colonial background is caught in the colonial matrix, there their view of the world is shaped by coloniality. The text implies that true modernity can be achieved through mental decolonization, and it is possible when individuals would break free from the oppressive structures of the past. In short we can say that TWT provides us a rich framework to explore the cognitive dimension of the characters to trace the themes. The study showcases the inherent psychosocial, and cultural struggle in postcolonial societies.

The study offers a contribution to both cognitive poetics and decolonial studies by showing the implication of the TWT to map the postcolonial literature. This shows the relevance of

the cognitive framework to unpack Pakistani Anglophone literature. This study calls for a dynamic reading of Pakistani fiction to understand the cultural conflicts, both internal and external, that shape the cognition of the postcolonial subjects who struggle and negotiate the legacy of colonization.

4. Conclusion

The characters of Sohail and Helen embody different attitudes towards modernity. Helen represents a Western concept of modernity expressed by individuality, freedom of choice, and rationality. On the other hand, Sohail, as a mentally colonised subject, grapples with the pressures and expectations due to his family and postcolonial background. The story pained the internal conflict by postcolonial subjects who admire Western modernity and are still unable to achieve it. The Western ideals attract Rafia, Amjad, and Sohail, all and yet simultaneously afraid of it. This conflict centres on Sohail's character, who is torn between his desire for Western modernity and his familial and societal obligations. His ambivalent condition expressed his internally colonised consciousness. Dialogues between different characters with symbolic imagery, such as in the opera's *Sleeping Beauty* and *Seine River*, serve as narrative devices to explore the themes of identity, belongings, and social expectation and their relation to modernity and coloniality. The interplay between modernity and coloniality is complexly woven through the narrative. TWT provides valuable insight into the complex nature of colonised subjects in postcolonial societies. It reveals the complex ways in which individuals negotiate their identities and relations with a changing socio-cultural landscape. The study also gives us insights into how the narrative constructs text worlds to portray the tensions inside the minds of the postcolonial subjects and their ambivalent attitude towards Western modernity. The text shows the negative enduring influences of colonisation. The story focuses on the issue of the ambivalent attitude of the colonial subjects and their love-and-hate relationship. It is a paradoxical situation. Characters are attracted and, at the same time, reluctant to adopt modernity. Moeenuddin shows how enduring legacies of colonialism persist in postcolonial Pakistan. Postcolonial subjects are still under the curse of colonialism.

Future researchers can apply TWT to a wide range of postcolonial texts. The internal conflicts and ambivalence toward modernity and coloniality can be studied within different cultural contexts and it would be an extension of this study. The study integrated different approaches to form a conceptual framework which can be used by future researchers to investigate more deeply the cognition of the postcolonial subjects in the literature of Global South

References

- Altaf, M., Batool, H., & Khan, S. Y. (2024). Exploring colonial legacies: Resistance and decoloniality in Nadeem Aslam's *The Blind Man's Garden*. *Panacea Journal of Linguistics & Literature*, 3(1), 93-104.
- Ali, S., Batool, H., & Maan, M. F. (2023). Faith and Identity in Stephen Crane's "In Heaven" and Taufiq Rafat's "This Blade of Grass": Linguistic relativity leading to worlds within words. *Journal of Contemporary Poetics*, 7(1), 65-83.
- Altaf, M., & Batool, H. (2024). Strategies of cognitive decoloniality in Nadeem Aslam's *The Golden Legend*. *Wah Academia Journal of Social Sciences*, 3(2), 450-471. <https://doi.org/10.5127/wahacademia322624>
- Batool, H., Noreen, R., & Nisar, M. (2024). Conceptualization of "Sadness" in Khadija Mastoor's *Aangan*. *Al-Aijaz Research Journal of Islamic Studies & Humanities*, 8(4), 1-19.
- Batool, H., Khalid, H., & Maan, M. F. (2022). The cultural appropriation of Urdu in Usman T. Malik's collection *Midnight Doorways: Fables from Pakistan*. *City University Research Journal of Literature and Linguistics*, 5(2), 96-121.
- Butt, S. R. A., Qasim, Z., & Javed, M. (2021). You are what you own: A transitivity analysis of *in other rooms, other wonders*. *University of Chitral Journal of Linguistics & Literature*, 5(2), 199-218.
- Gavins, J. (2007). *Text world theory: An introduction*. Edinburgh University Press.
- Gavins, J., & Steen, G. (2003). *Cognitive poetics in practice*. Routledge.
- Gohar, G., Maan, M. F., & Batool, H. (2023). An exploration of metafunctions and binary oppositions in Pakistani paintings and poems. *Pakistan Languages and Humanities Review*, 7(2), 273-283.
- Hai, A. (2014). *Postcolonial servitude: Interiority and system in Daniyal Mueenuddin's in other rooms, other wonders*. The Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Haq, A., Maan, M. F., & Batool, H. (2024). Unveiling the elements of a fairy tale: An exploration of Proppian narrative functions in *A Thousand Splendid Suns*. *Journal of English Language, Literature and Education*, 6(4), 24-43.
- Javaid, S., Rabbani, M., & Habib, A. (2021). Hybridity leading towards identity crisis: A study of Daniyal Moeenuddin's stories "Our Lady of Paris" (2009)" and "Lily" as Cultural Rai. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 5(3), 18-27.
- Mueenuddin, D. (2009). *In other rooms, other wonders*. Norton.
- Malik, S. S., Batool, H., & Maan, M. F. (2022). The cultural appropriation of Urdu in Usman T. Malik's *Midnight Doorways: Fables from Pakistan*. *City University Research Journal of Literature and Linguistics*, 5(2), 96-121.
- Mueenuddin, D. (2012). *Sameer and the samosas*. The New Yorker.

- Younker, T. (2009, February 23). *Daniyal Mueenuddin and Mohsin Hamid: Two 'internally displaced' writers*. Asia Society. <https://www.asiasociety.org/daniyal-mueenuddin-and->
- Mueenuddin, D. (Alan Franks). (2009, July 11). Alan Franks interviews Daniyal Mueenuddin. *The Times*.
- Nazir, B., Hussain, Z., & Hussain, Z. (2022). You sell me out: Representation of peripheral Pakistan in Daniyal Mueenuddin's in other rooms, other wonders: *Pakistan Linguistic and Historical Review*, 6(2), 24. [http://doi.org/10.47205/plhr.2022\(6-II\)24](http://doi.org/10.47205/plhr.2022(6-II)24)
- Stockwell, P. (2002). *Cognitive poetics: An introduction*. Routledge.
- Sadaf, S. (2014). Daniyal Mueenuddin's dying men. *South Asian History and Culture*, 5(4), 490-504. DOI: 10.1080/19472498.2014.936207
- Stockwell, P. (2009). *Texture: A cognitive aesthetics of reading*. Edinburgh University Press.
- Tariq, H. (2018). The feudal system of Pakistan in Daniyal Mueenuddin's short stories: A marxist critique. *Linguistics and Literature Review*. Retrieved from <https://ssrn.com/abstract=3825397>
- Van Peer, W. (2001). *Stylistics and Psychology: Investigations of foregrounding*. John Benjamins Publishing.
- Werth, P. (1999). *Text worlds: Representing conceptual space in discourse*. Longman.
- Werth, P., & Gavins, J. (Eds.). (2005). *Discourse and culture: Theoretical approaches*. Narr
- Waheed, K. (2017). *Marxist reading of Daniyal Mueenuddin's short stories in his book "in other rooms other wonders"*. University of Lahore, Chenab Campus, Gujrat, Pakistan.

Citation of this paper

Altaf, M. & Batool, H, (2024). Navigating Modernity and Coloniality: Text World Theory Analysis of "Our Lady of Paris". *Erevna: Journal of Linguistics and Literature*, 8(2), 37 -57.